

**SANTA CRUZ METROPOLITAN TRANSIT DISTRICT
BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING MINUTES
REGULAR MEETING
JANUARY 23, 2015 – 9:00 AM
SANTA CRUZ CITY CHAMBERS
809 CENTER STREET
SANTA CRUZ, CA 95060**

A regular meeting of the Board of Directors of the Santa Cruz Metropolitan Transit District (METRO) was convened on Friday, January 23, 2015, at the Santa Cruz City Chambers located at 809 Center Street in Santa Cruz, CA.

The Board Meeting Agenda Packet can be found online at www.SCMTD.com and is available for inspection at Santa Cruz Metro's Administrative offices at 110 Vernon Street, Santa Cruz, California.

This document has been created with accessibility in mind. This document passes the Adobe Acrobat XI Accessibility Full Check. If you have any questions about the accessibility of this document, please email your inquiry to accessibility@scmttd.com

SECTION I: OPEN SESSION

1 SWEAR IN NEW DIRECTORS

Leslyn Syren, METRO General Counsel, was present to swear in METRO's new Directors:

Cynthia Chase, representing City of Santa Cruz;
Jimmy Dutra, representing City of Watsonville

2 CALL TO ORDER at 9:03A

3 ROLL CALL: The following Directors were **present**, representing quorum:

Director Dene Bustichi (Chair)	City of Scotts Valley
Director Ed Bottorff	City of Capitola
Director Cynthia Chase	City of Santa Cruz
Director Jimmy Dutra	City of Watsonville
Director Zach Friend	County of Santa Cruz
Director Deborah Lane	County of Santa Cruz
Director Bruce McPherson	County of Santa Cruz
Director Mike Rotkin	County of Santa Cruz
Ex-Officer Director Donna Blitzer	UCSC

STAFF PRESENT:

Alex Clifford, CEO
Leslyn Syren, General Counsel

METRO EMPLOYEES AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO VOLUNTARILY INDICATED THEY WERE PRESENT (IN ALPHABETICAL ORDER) WERE:

Heather Adamson, AMBAG
Angela Aitken, METRO
Erron Alvey, METRO
Carolyn Derwing, METRO
George Dondero, SCCRTC
Liseth Guizar, METRO
Thomas Hiltner, METRO

Debbie Kinslow, METRO
Clay Kompf, Area Agency on Aging
Peter Pethoc, SCHS
Allen Pierce, METRO
April Warnock, METRO
Daniel Zaragoza, METRO

Director Rotkin requested that Agenda Item 9.05, Accept and File the METRO Paracruz Operations Status Report for October and November 2014 be pulled from Consent and inserted into the Regular Agenda as Item 10A.

4 ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chair Bustichi announced that Spanish language interpretation is being provided by Carlos Landaverry for any agenda item for which these services are needed. Mr. Landaverry approached the podium, introduced himself and alerted attendees as to his position in the Chambers.

Chair Bustichi added that today's meeting is being broadcast by Community Television of Santa Cruz County.

Chair Bustichi opened the microphone to attendees for announcements. Hearing none, the meeting proceeded with the Public Hearing.

5 PUBLIC HEARING: DISCUSS POSSIBLE OPTIONS FOR ROUTES 6 AND 68

Erich Friedrich, Sr. Transit Planner, provided an introduction and history of the proposal. Carolyn Derwing, Scheduling Analyst, explained the costs associated with service to the La Posada area.

Directors Rotkin and Chase asked questions regarding how the costs, how they were developed and the impact to revenue with connection changes. Carolyn addressed his concerns. She noted that Route 68 is expensive, non-profitable and does impact ridership.

Chair Bustichi opened the floor for public comment at 9:20A

The attached letter from the Committee for La Posada Bus Service was distributed by the clerk to the attending board members, CEO Clifford and General Counsel Syren.

Public comments were addressed to the board and assembly from the podium.

Elaine Gallagher, representing La Posada, spoke from the podium and expressed her excitement to be at public hearing with potential for regular service as promised

approximately 9 years ago. Their Committee submitted two petitions in support of Route 68. She relayed her hazardous experience when crossing at Frederick Street last week. She and her friend have discovered that although an electric wheelchair fits between two power poles, a manual wheelchair does not.

Becky Taylor, representing the Santa Cruz County Commission on Disabilities, noted the importance of a neighborhood bus as it represents freedom and independence.

Sara Schifferen, along with Patti Miller, rode various routes to experience them through the communities. She noted that 9 people got on at the downtown station; by the time they reached the mall, the bus was full where everyone got off. She looked for connecting buses; there were none which meant they needed to wait 40 minutes for the return bus (68) which they missed. Instead, they rode another bus into Santa Cruz where they experienced broken sidewalks and dangerous encounters with automobiles.

Patti Miller, La Posada resident, acknowledged that the bus system is very complex and expressed her appreciation for mass transit and the METRO. The recent opening of Arana Gulch provides the potential for additional ridership on Route 68. Plus an additional "swing around" would assist La Posada, Dominican Rehab and other businesses in the area. She also mentioned the cracked sidewalks.

Mary Chamberlain, La Posada resident, reminded the assembly that confined mobility affects mental and physical abilities. The La Posada shuttle service is limited; the residents appreciate METRO services as an alternative.

Maria Gardenia, Central Coast for Independent Living, stressed the desire for an active, independent lifestyle of those with limited mobility and their dependence on mass transit. She asked the board to consider themselves as elderly, without a car, and what it would mean to have the ability to use a bus / bus stop directly in front of their home. She stressed consideration of the safety of the La Posada community.

Clay Kompf, Seniors Council, agreed that based on costs, the route should be cut but added that METRO is known for supporting independence. He noted that La Posada was built where it is due to the existing bus lines at the time of construction. Transit is a key component to community planning. He recommends an alternate route be considered to serve the community in a safe manner.

Peter Pethoc is a weekday passenger who uses the service to get to work. As such, he asked that the board meetings be switched to another date/time since he works Fridays. He also asked that Routes 6 and 7 be combined to better serve the beach area, Route 10 nighttime service be increased and that our Supervisors ride the buses as passengers.

Eduardo Montesino, UTU Representative, echoed the need to do something for those in our community with limited mobility. He recommended a re-investigation of RTC funding which was for two years; perhaps there are other options.

Ernestina Saldana, Chair of the Commission of Disabilities, urged the board to keep in mind the public needs. The Commission wrote a letter in support of La Posada in June 2013.

Hearing no other comments, Chair Bustichi closed the public comment period at 9:47A.

CEO Clifford spoke of his appreciation for the process which allows the public to express their opinions and thanked the public for their support and ridership. Metro staff has presented their recommendation and will proceed as the board recommends. To summarize, Route 6 has not achieved the productivity criteria set by the board, does not meet La Posada needs and has not been requested; i.e., can be eliminated. While it may be possible to make a modification on route 68's run time to include the La Posada ridership, the additional 6-10 minutes to achieve a slightly larger customer base would impact hundreds of other riders with the potential to miss connections, be late to work, etc. This change would also increase operating costs. As a public service, we cannot be all things to all people and there is a cost in trying to do so. The recent structural deficit exercise emphasizes the budget constraints. Public transit service is generally scheduled to be within $\frac{3}{4}$ mile of the major corridors; buses meandering through neighborhood streets raise safety issues and don't serve the core ridership. While he heard the concerns surrounding inadequate lighting and cracked sidewalks, he reminded the assembly that these issues aren't the responsibility of the METRO, but the City and/or County. CEO Clifford requested the board consider the staff recommendation and approve the changes requested.

Director Rotkin expressed concern that a manual wheelchair cannot fit through the power poles on the sidewalk and would like the Board to advocate on behalf of our riders. He recommended that the City examine the light timing at the corner; perhaps install a flashing yellow light at the intersection. In response to his question, Carolyn Derwing noted that all of the route 68 buses are interlined.

Director Lane stated that the bus system has always been about the people in our communities. If Santa Cruz wishes to continue to be a leader in accessibility for the public, she believes we must support our people.

Director Friend asked that we recognize the realities of being a board member; the reality is it's a question of tradeoffs. Director Friend agreed that the numbers do not support continuing the present service. Our changes have the potential to affect the entire county through routes, costs, etc. He suggested an option may be to explore a contract service specifically provided to La Posada as a connection to the METRO system. CEO Clifford responded that we have not approached La Posada regarding this specifically; however, METRO did speak with La Posada management and verified that they do provide shuttle service for their residents but that it may require some adjustment to accommodate the needs of their residents.

Directors Dutra and Chase thanked the public for attending and asked the attendees to reach out to their City to ensure their safety by properly maintaining the sidewalks, lighting, etc.

Director McPherson stated he would follow the recommendation of the METRO staff after Finance Manager Aitken and George Dondero, Executive Director of SCCRTC, verified the termination date of RTC's funding of the route.

ACTION: MOTION THAT THE BOARD ACCEPT STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO ELIMINATE ROUTE 6 AND RETAIN ROUTE 68 AS CURRENTLY SCHEDULED EFFECTIVE MARCH 12, 2015.

**MOTION: DIRECTOR FRIEND SECONDED: MCPHERSON
MOTION WAS PASSED WITH SEVEN AYES (Directors Bustichi, Bottorff, Chase, Dutra, Friend, McPherson, Rotkin) AND ONE NAY (Director Deborah Lane)**

Chair Bustichi added that former Mayor Robinson had been tenacious in getting safety issues addressed when brought to the City's attention. He recommended the Board write a letter to the City of Santa Cruz addressing the sidewalk, light and road safety issues.

METRO staff was requested to return to the Board in the March/April timeframe with an update re the legalities to the contract with La Posada.

6 COMMUNICATIONS TO THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Chair Bustichi opened the microphone to attendees for announcements at 10:22A. .

John Strange, Santa Cruz resident, brought the Board's attention to what he felt is a potential safety issue at the northbound Highway 17 Pasatiempo exit. He would like the buses to come to a mandatory full stop, even when no riders are at the bus stop, as they seem to go too fast.

Chair Bustichi called for a brief break at 10:25A.

Return to Chambers at 10:35A

7 LABOR ORGANIZATION COMMUNICATIONS

Chair Bustichi opened the microphone to the assembly.

Speaking from the podium, Will Regan, VMU Representative, welcomed the new board members.

Carolyn Derwing, SEIU-SEA President, introduced herself, welcomed the new Board members and wished them luck.

Many Martinez, SEIU Representative, also welcomed the new Board members noting working together is a joint effort.

Eduardo Montesino, representing UTU/ParaCruz Operators, welcomed the new Board members to the METRO family.

8 ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTATION TO SUPPORT EXISTING AGENDA ITEMS

Chair Bustichi announced additional documentation had been distributed at each Board Member's chair and was available for the public at the rear of the Chambers. CEO Clifford clarified that the organization chart was supplemental to Agenda Item 10, Creation of a Planning and Development Manager Position and that Slide 16 was a revision to the Structural Deficit presentation.

CONSENT AGENDA

- 9-01 NOTICE OF ACTIONS TAKEN IN CLOSED SESSION
- 9-02 ACCEPT AND FILE PRELIMINARY APPROVED CHECKS JOURNAL DETAIL FOR THE MONTH OF OCTOBER 2014
- 9-03 ACCEPT AND FILE MINUTES OF THE SANTA CRUZ METRO BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING OF JANUARY 9, 2015
- 9-04 ACCEPT AND FILE SANTA CRUZ COUNTY REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES FROM DECEMBER 4, 2014
- 9-05 ACCEPT AND FILE THE METRO PARACRUZ OPERATIONS STATUS REPORT FOR OCTOBER AND NOVEMBER 2014
- 9-06 ACCEPT AND FILE METRO SYSTEM RIDERSHIP REPORTS FOR THE MONTHS OF OCTOBER AND NOVEMBER 2014
- 9-07 ACCEPT AND FILE STATUS REPORT OF ACTIVE GRANTS AND SUBMITTED GRANT PROPOSALS FOR JANUARY 2015
- 9-08 SANTA CRUZ COUNTY REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION PASSENGER RAIL STUDY UPDATE
- 9-09 NOTICE OF INTENTION TO AMEND SANTA CRUZ METRO'S CONFLICT-OF-INTEREST CODE

ACTION: MOTION TO APPROVE THE CONSENT AGENDA WITH AGENDA ITEM 9-05 PULLED FROM CONSENT AND INSERTED INTO THE REGULAR AGENDA AS ITEM 10A.

MOTION: DIRECTOR ROTKIN SECONDED: DIRECTOR FRIEND

MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY WITH 8 AYES (Directors Bustichi, Bottorff, Chase, Deborah Lane, Dutra, Friend, McPherson, Rotkin).

REGULAR AGENDA

- 10 CREATION OF A PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT MANAGER POSITION
See org chart distributed at meeting
CEO Clifford thanked the Board for allowing him the time to review the organization's structure and provided a short history of the department and position request. He has determined that the department requires a leadership position. Chair Bustichi provided background to the new Board Members regarding classification of staff.

ACTION: MOTION TO APPROVE THE CREATION OF A PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT MANAGER POSITION
MOTION: DIRECTOR ROTKIN SECONDED: DIRECTOR McPHERSON

MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY WITH 8 AYES (Directors Bustichi, Bottorff, Chase, Dutra, Friend, McPherson, Rotkin).

10A. (PREVIOUSLY 9-05) ACCEPT AND FILE THE METRO PARACRUZ OPERATIONS STATUS REPORT FOR OCTOBER AND NOVEMBER 2014

Director Rotkin asked why the on time incidences reflected in 9-05A.1 were lower in 2014 than in 2013; specifically, 94.88% in 2013 vs 90.02% in 2014. April Warnock, ParaTransit Superintendent, responded it was due to increased ridership. 2014 October's ridership was the largest October in the history of METRO. Additionally, the new system has allowed for increased data accuracy. METRO remains committed to improving on-time performance.

Regarding Item 9-05B1 Director Rotkin noted that the actual performance is below the stated performance goal.. What are METRO's plans to achieve the performance goal? April responded that we continue to encourage off-peak ridership.

ACTION: MOTION TO ACCEPT AND FILE THE METRO PARACRUZ OPERATIONS STATUS REPORT FOR OCTOBER AND NOVEMBER 2014

MOTION: DIRECTOR ROTKIN SECONDED: DIRECTOR FRIEND

MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY WITH 8 AYES (Directors Bustichi, Bottorff, Chase, Dutra, Friend, McPherson, Rotkin).

11 STRUCTURAL DEFICIT WORKSHOP V OF VII - Correction from VIII to VII

Director Rotkin asked for clarification of legislative support. CEO Clifford noted that this is a major effort by APTA. Chair Bustichi added that there is general universal support for continuing this effort.

Referring to the revised slide 16 distributed at the meeting, Maintenance Manager, Al Pierce, elaborated on the facilities deferred maintenance, PMI program and the development of a plan to address priorities.

Director Rotkin questioned the addition of new bus stops, shelters, etc. CEO Clifford responded that the current plan does not include this but it is a future opportunity.

Director Deborah Lane asked if it was possible to increase the Highway 17 passenger cost in a phased approach. Erich Friedrich, Sr. Transit Planner, will investigate options and advise. He added that the route has seen increased ridership and, when the price was last increased in 2010, the ridership remained flat for a couple of months then continued to rise.

Director Dutra asked what impact the low gas prices have. Erich responded that 2011 also saw a lowering of gas prices but ridership continued to rise.

Chair Bustichi suggested advertising of onboard wifi as a selling point. A number of Directors agreed and noted the increase in overall traffic on highway 17. Director Dutra asked staff to investigate advertising on bus TV monitors. (There are no monitors on the current buses.)

Chair Bustichi asked if adding stops in Los Gatos or express routes to other venues such as Levi Stadium have begun. CEO Clifford responded that he will be speaking with

the CEO of VTA and that Director Leopold and Chair Bustichi may also meet with the VTA team to discuss. Chair Bustichi emphasized the importance of their participation and/or assistance.

Director McPherson asked if there is any upcoming legislation that might assist with student transportation. For example, is there a portion of President Obama's program that we could participate in? Erich wasn't aware of any but stressed our grants team is great at locating funding.

2016 Sales Tax Initiative: Chair Bustichi recommended METRO specify a dollar amount required, rather than a percentage. Much discussion among the Board regarding the pros and cons of participating in RTC's polling efforts versus conducting METRO's own as well as voters' possible reaction and resultant opportunities. George Dondero, SCCRTC, advised the Board that the RTC poll scheduled for March 2015 is privately funded with a focus on county transportation needs (road maintenance, highway 1 improvement, bike/pedestrian projects, and public transit); therefore, not a public document. CEO Clifford committed to provide an estimate for METRO polling costs at a future meeting, and will continue to monitor RTC results.

Chair Bustichi opened the floor for public comment.

Manny Martinez, SEIU Representative, wondered effect the sales tax would have on the public.

Director Friend departed at 11:50A

Director Rotkin wanted to know the percentage of overall operating costs for fixed route versus Paratransit.

Chair Bustichi asked how realistic the FY16 ridership and marketing numbers are. CEO Clifford recognizes the risk and that the numbers are aggressive. Chair Bustichi advised caution.

Discussions around the use of the Scotts Valley Transit Center parking lot being utilized by private charters and others who are not using the METRO services ensued with Directors theorizing and strategizing how to realize profit from the existing structure. METRO does not want to disallow the use and possible revenue stream. It was noted that the cities and county have the legal ability to limit pick-ups and drop-offs of riders throughout the region.

Over-the-road (OTR) buses were discussed. Director McPherson was curious as to possible savings with the upgrade to OTR buses. Maintenance Manager, Al Pierce, reminded the Board that the current engines aren't engineered for over the road use. Anecdotally, on time performance, quicker transport times and overall savings are anticipated.

Director Rotkin departed at 12:30P

ParaTransit savings options were discussed. Chair Bustichi asked about out of range service areas during various seasonal offerings. April Warnock, Paratransit Superintendent, answered this would be addressed with premium fares.

Due to staff and timing constraints, CEO Clifford recommended conducting three public hearings in the north, central and south areas of the county to collect public feedback. Staff will then return to the Board with recommendations. Chair Bustichi agreed with the three public meetings concept and suggested presentations to each of the city councils and board of supervisors' meetings be held. The Sales Tax Initiative will not be addressed at either venue.

Chase and McPherson left at 12:45P, which resulted in a loss of quorum

12 MONTHLY BUDGET STATUS REPORT YEAR TO DATE AS OF OCTOBER 31, 2014
Finance Manager, Angela Aitken, presented the above subject. General discussion followed.

13 CEO TO GIVE ORAL REPORT
CEO Clifford brought the Board's attention to the End of the Year Accomplishments, Summary and Goals documents distributed at the meeting and asked that they review in preparation for goal setting in the organization.

The next Structural Deficit presentation will be at the February 27, 2015 board meeting.

14 REVIEW OF ITEMS TO BE DISCUSSED IN CLOSED SESSION
None per Leslyn Syren, District Counsel

15 Chair Bustichi announced the next meeting is FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 13, 2015 AT 8:30 AM, SANTA CRUZ METRO ADMIN OFFICES, 110 VERNON STREET, SANTA CRUZ REGULAR AGENDA

16 ADJOURNMENT
Chair Bustichi adjourned at 12:50P

Pursuant to Section 54954.2(a)(1) of the Government Code of the State of California, this agenda was posted at least 72 hours in advance of the scheduled meeting at a public place freely accessible to the public 24 hours a day. The agenda packet and materials related to an item on this Agenda submitted to the Board of Directors after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Santa Cruz METRO Administrative Office (110 Vernon Street, Santa Cruz) during normal business hours. Such documents are also available on the Santa Cruz METRO website at www.scmttd.com subject to staff's ability to post the document before the meeting.